



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, MARCH 10, 2011
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE ROOMS 1, 2, AND 3
7447 E. INDIAN SCHOOL RD., STE 105**

PRESENT: David Schmidt, Chair
Len Marcisz, Vice-Chair
Bob Cook, Commissioner
Timothy P. Burns, Commissioner
Earl Eisenhower, Commissioner
DeeJaye Lockwood, Commissioner
Jennifer Smithey, Commissioner (arrived 5:32 p.m.)

STAFF: Don Meserve, Historic Preservation Officer/City Archaeologist
Debbie Abele, Historic Preservation Consultant

VISITOR: None

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Schmidt called the Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

Roll Call

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

Public Comment

None.

- 1. Possible Action: Discussion, Amendment, and Possible Approval of:**
- 2/10/11 Regular Meeting Minutes

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ, 2ND BY COMMISSIONER BURNS TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 10, 2011 MINUTES AS DRAFTED. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY, SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

- 2. Report/Discussion/Possible Direction: Downtown Survey Results and Potential Designations**

This agenda item is a task from the approved 2011 Work Program. Mr. Meserve described the contents of the packet on this topic including the three maps of redevelopment areas in the downtown. City redevelopment policies declared large portions of the downtown as meeting definitions for slums and blight, and the City had the authority to use condemnations in the areas.

Ms. Abele conducted the downtown survey about ten years ago and described the process and survey results. A historic context was written for Scottsdale's Development as an Arts Colony and Tourist Destination. Buildings within a square mile area were all reviewed excluding residential properties. About 750 individual parcels were initially surveyed with the number reduced to about 500 commercial parcels that were divided into groups by age, alterations, relation to arts and tourism, and association with local themes. The origins and character-defining elements of the architecture were studied resulting in the identification of six styles for the period. The Commission then looked at the seven aspects for integrity assessments; location, setting, design, materials, workmanship, association and feeling. Based upon field trips by Commissioners and members of the Historic Register Committee, a List of Downtown Properties for Further Consideration was approved by the Commission.

Several properties have since been taken through the public hearing process and placed on the local register including; Saba's Department Store, Hotel Valley Ho, Craftsman Court, Adobe Apartments, Pink Pony Restaurant, and Sugar Bowl Restaurant. Efforts to get the Valley National Bank building, now Chase, on the southeast corner of Scottsdale and Indian School Roads and properties on Pima Plaza including a 2-story Ralph Haver building were unsuccessful due to owner opposition. Proposed districts included a portion of Fifth Avenue and a row of galleries on the south side of Main Street. The Commission thanked Ms. Abele for the briefing and update on the downtown survey results.

3. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Consider Withdrawing 5th Avenue Historic District Cases 18-ZN-2007 #2 and 4-HP-2007 #2

Mr. Meserve noted that the HPC had initiated an HP map amendment for portions of 7000-7100 blocks of 5th Avenue that was submitted 10/6/2008. Current Planning staff asked if the HPC would withdraw the case since it has been primarily inactive for two years due to the recession and other factors. Mr. Meserve stated that he would recommend withdrawing this inactive case and that the Commission consider initiating a new case when economic or other conditions appear more favorable for designating a district on 5th Avenue.

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ, 2ND BY COMMISSIONER EISENHOWER TO APPROVE THE WITHDRAWAL OF CASES 18-ZN-2007#2 AND 4-HP-2007#2 FOR THE 5TH AVENUE HISTORIC DISTRICT. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY, SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

4. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Updated and Revised Draft Bylaws

Mr. Meserve said that the city has asked all boards and commissions to update their bylaws. This requirement was one of the results of the audit report. He described several new sections that have been added to the Commission bylaws in the draft to make them more consistent with other bodies that conduct public hearings such as the Planning Commission or Development Review Board (DRB). The draft bylaws have been reviewed by the City Attorney's Office and their suggestions have been incorporated into the draft. Staff recommends approval.

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ, 2ND BY COMMISSIONER BURNS TO APPROVE THE AMENDED BYLAWS AS DRAFTED. MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY, SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

5. Report/Discussion/Possible Direction: HPO Report on Upcoming Events, Activities and Projects

Mr. Meserve noted that there was insufficient time to meet the legal notice requirements for a hearing today on Villa Monterey so, after discussing the hearing with the Chair, staff set the public hearing date for the Commission's HP overlay zoning case for Villa Monterey Units 1-7 for Thursday, March 17, 2011 at 5:30 pm at Granite Reef Senior Center. The HPC discussed the conduct of the hearing and the need for Commissioners to state for the record how the neighborhood is eligible for designation and whether it has integrity. There may be a large turnout of Villa Monterey residents at the hearing. The Commission decided to make their hearing on this case the main item for their special meeting on March 17, 2011.

After briefly discussing when to consider places of worship, the Commission directed staff to place the Commission's review of Places of Worship on the April 14, 2011 regular HPC agenda. Commissioners will each select their top candidates for consideration and then discuss their selections to develop an approved Commission list in a similar way this was done for townhouse developments. The Commission also directed staff to put a discussion of Taliesin West HP boundary on the April agenda. Ms. Abele proposed rescheduling the training session on design guidelines until after the hearings are concluded on Villa Monterey Units 1-7. The training may be scheduled for a Thursday evening special meeting in May or June.

Commissioner Cook asked about the celebration at Kerr Cultural Center on February 3, 2011. Mr. Meserve reported that it was a very enjoyable evening celebration with special recognition at the event for the Mayor and City Council, and the Historic Preservation Commission. Kerr Cultural Center was added to the Scottsdale Historic Register by City Council on June 17, 2008. He put several photos and newspaper articles on display boards on the patio. The event celebrated the ASU property being listed on the local, state and national registers.

6. Commissioner Comments and Announcements

Vice-Chair Marcisz mentioned that a leadership conference by the McDowell Sonoran Conservancy on April 2, 2011 will not include members of city commissions. He requested an agenda item on Browns Ranch, Browns Ranch Rock Shelter and Public Information on Ranching, such as concepts for placing historic ranching information at the Browns Ranch Trailhead. Mr. Meserve will advise Preserve staff that this item will be on the Commission agenda for discussion and will invite them to attend the meeting.

Commissioner Cook mentioned that it was great to have the HPC identified in a report as one of the highest-ranked panels in the city for effectiveness. The Chair thanked staff for assisting the Commission in being effective. The Chair also mentioned setting up a meeting with the Mayor to provide a progress report and to discuss the review process for the Villa Monterey historic district. Mr. Meserve felt such a meeting was timely since the audit report was released and the Mayor and Council just received the Commission's annual report.

7. Future Meeting Dates and Agenda Items

The special meeting on March 17, 2011 will be at the Granite Reef Senior Center in Room 7. The next regular meeting will be on April 14, 2011 in One Civic Center.

Adjournment: 6:56 p.m.

Summary Minutes Prepared by Don Meserve